

**Comments on “A proportional-integral extremum-seeking controller design technique”
[Automatica 77 (2017) 61–67]**

Krilašević, Suad; Grammatico, Sergio

DOI

[10.1016/j.automatica.2021.109932](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.automatica.2021.109932)

Publication date

2022

Document Version

Final published version

Published in

Automatica

Citation (APA)

Krilašević, S., & Grammatico, S. (2022). Comments on “A proportional-integral extremum-seeking controller design technique” [Automatica 77 (2017) 61–67]. *Automatica*, 135, Article 109932. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.automatica.2021.109932>

Important note

To cite this publication, please use the final published version (if applicable).
Please check the document version above.

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download, forward or distribute the text or part of it, without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license such as Creative Commons.

Takedown policy

Please contact us and provide details if you believe this document breaches copyrights.
We will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Green Open Access added to TU Delft Institutional Repository

'You share, we take care!' - Taverne project

<https://www.openaccess.nl/en/you-share-we-take-care>

Otherwise as indicated in the copyright section: the publisher is the copyright holder of this work and the author uses the Dutch legislation to make this work public.



Correspondence

Comments on “A proportional-integral extremum-seeking controller design technique” [Automatica 77 (2017) 61–67][☆]Suad Krilašević^{*}, Sergio Grammatico

Delft Center for Systems and Control, TU Delft, The Netherlands

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 20 July 2020

Received in revised form 23 February 2021

Accepted 1 March 2021

Available online 8 October 2021

ABSTRACT

In the proof of [Guay and Dochain (2017), Th.1], Equation 6 is incorrect.

© 2021 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

In this note, we show by a counterexample that Equation 6 in (Guay & Dochain, 2017),

$$\frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(\pi(\hat{u}))g(\pi(\hat{u})) = \frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(\pi(\hat{u}))\frac{\partial \pi(\hat{u})}{\partial \hat{u}} \quad (1)$$

which is used in the proof of Theorem 1 (page 65, left column, line 16) to obtain a negative Lyapunov derivative, is incorrect. This error also appears in Guay (2016, Equ. 6), Guay and Atta (2018, Equ. 16) and Guay, Vandermeulen, Dougherty, and McLellan (2018, p. 505, left column, line 27).

As a class of counterexamples, we consider linear systems with strongly convex quadratic cost, specifically, in the notation of (Guay & Dochain, 2017),

$$f(x) = Ax, \quad g(x) = B, \quad h(x) = \frac{1}{2}x^T Qx + x^T p, \quad (2)$$

where $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is Hurwitz, $B \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$, $Q \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ is positive definite, $p \in \mathbb{R}^n$. In Guay and Dochain (2017, Assum. 4), we take $k_g = 0$. Therefore, the steady-state mapping is given by

$$\pi(\hat{u}) = -A^{-1}B\hat{u}. \quad (3)$$

Then, we have that $\frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(x) = Qx + p$, hence $\frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(\pi(\hat{u})) = -QA^{-1}B\hat{u} + p$, and the left-hand side of (1) is

$$\frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(\pi(\hat{u}))g(\pi(\hat{u})) = (p^T - \hat{u}^T B^T A^{-T} Q)B. \quad (4)$$

Since $\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial \hat{u}} = -A^{-1}B$, the right-hand side of (1) is given by

$$\frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(\pi(\hat{u}))\frac{\partial \pi}{\partial \hat{u}} = -(p^T - \hat{u}^T B^T A^{-T} Q)A^T B. \quad (5)$$

Considering that the vectors in (4) and (5) are not equal in general (unless $A = -I$ as in Krilašević & Grammatico, 2020), we conclude that Guay and Dochain (2017, Equ. 6) is incorrect.

[☆] DOI of original article: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.automatica.2016.11.018>.

The material in this paper was not presented at any conference. This paper was recommended for publication in revised form by Associate Editor Iman Shames under the direction of Editor André L. Tits.

^{*} Corresponding author.

E-mail addresses: s.krilasevic-1@tudelft.nl (S. Krilašević), s.grammatico@tudelft.nl (S. Grammatico).

Equation 6 in Guay and Dochain (2017) is used in the proof of Theorem 1 on page 65, while applying $\frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(\pi(\hat{u}))g(\pi(\hat{u}))\hat{u} = \frac{\partial \ell}{\partial \hat{u}}(\hat{u})\hat{u} \leq -\alpha_u \|\hat{u}\|^2$, for all \hat{u} . Next, we show that this incorrectness of Guay and Dochain (2017, Equ. 6) compromises the Lyapunov-based proof of Guay and Dochain (2017, Thm. 1) for our counterexample in (2). Let u^* be the minimizer of $l(\hat{u})$ and let $\tilde{u} := u^* - \hat{u}$. From (4), it holds

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial h}{\partial x}(\pi(\hat{u}))g(\pi(\hat{u}))\tilde{u} &= (p - \hat{u}^T B^T A^{-T} Q)B\tilde{u} \\ &+ (p - u^{*T} B^T A^{-T} Q)B\tilde{u} - (p - u^{*T} B^T A^{-T} Q)B\tilde{u} \\ &= \hat{u}^T B^T A^{-T} Q B\tilde{u} + (p - u^{*T} B^T A^{-T} Q)B\tilde{u} \\ &= \frac{1}{2}\tilde{u}^T B^T (A^{-T} Q + Q A^{-1}) B\tilde{u} \\ &+ (p - u^{*T} B^T A^{-T} Q)B\tilde{u}. \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

The Lyapunov analysis in Guay and Dochain (2017) relies on the strict negative-definiteness of the quadratic term in \tilde{u} , as it is used to majorize other positive terms (see for example, the last inequality of the left column on page 65). However, for our case in (2), the matrix $M := B^T (A^{-T} Q + Q A^{-1}) B$ in (6) is not always negative definite.

References

- Guay, Martin (2016). A perturbation-based proportional integral extremum-seeking control approach. *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, 61(11), 3370–3381.
- Guay, Martin, & Atta, Khalid Tourkey (2018). Dual mode extremum-seeking control via Lie-bracket averaging approximations. In *2018 annual American control conference (ACC)* (pp. 2972–2977). IEEE.
- Guay, Martin, & Dochain, Denis (2017). A proportional-integral extremum-seeking controller design technique. *Automatica*, 77, 61–67.
- Guay, Martin, Vandermeulen, Isaac, Dougherty, Sean, & McLellan, P James (2018). Distributed extremum-seeking control over networks of dynamically coupled unstable dynamic agents. *Automatica*, 93, 498–509.
- Krilašević, Suad, & Grammatico, Sergio (2020). An integral Nash equilibrium control scheme for a class of multi-agent linear systems. In *IFAC world congress* (pp. 5449–5454).